Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 1-800-624-3270 (406) 586-4364 watercourt@mt.gov FILED
01/03/2023
Sara Calkins
CLERK
Montana Water Court
STATE OF MONTANA
By: D'Ann CIGLER
40K-0710-R-2022
White, Eugene
3.00

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA LOWER MISSOURI DIVISION WHITEWATER CREEK - BASIN (40K) PRELIMINARY DECREE

CLAIMANT: USA (Dept. of Interior Bureau of Land Mgmt.)

CASE 40K-0710-R-2022 40K 73414-00 40K 73684-00

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. Please review this report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

The above-captioned claims appeared in the Preliminary Decree for the Lower Missouri River Division, Whitewater Creek. The claims did not receive objections or notices of intent to appear, but did receive issue remarks during the DNRC's claims reexamination. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Claim 40K 73414-00 received the following issue remark from the DNRC: THE CLAIMED VOLUME APPEARS TO BE EXCESSIVE FOR THE CLAIMED PURPOSE. THE CLAIMED VOLUME EQUALS 2.61 TIMES THE CAPACITY OF THE RESERVOIR.

Claim 40K 73684-00 received the following issue remark from the DNRC: THE CLAIMED VOLUME APPEARS TO BE EXCESSIVE FOR THE CLAIMED PURPOSE. THE CLAIMED VOLUME EQUALS 7.21 TIMES THE CAPACITY OF THE RESERVOIR.

- 2. On May 25, 2022, the Court set a filing deadline requiring the Claimants to work with the DNRC under §85-2-248(5), MCA to address the issue remarks on the claims.
- 3. On August 25, 2022, DNRC Water Resources Specialist Pam Weinmeister filed her *Memorandum* in this matter. Ms. Weinmeister's *Memo* states that she was contacted on July 1, 2022, by Melissa Norris on behalf of claimant United States Bureau of Land Management ("BLM"). In her *Memo*, Ms. Weinmeister states that Ms. Norris provided a Project Completion Report for reservoir PR-86, which is the reservoir associated with claim 40K 73414-00 and provided verbal information during the call regarding the reservoir record for reservoir PR-156 Ret Res, the reservoir associated with claim 40K 73684-00. Ms. Weinmeister further states that the BLM also submitted Verified Motions to Amend the water right claims aimed at bringing each of the reservoir records into historical conformity. The *Memo* includes proposed abstracts for each claim denoting the following proposed modifications:

40K 73414-00

*Reservoir: ONSTREAM

Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County

SESWNE 6 37N 31E PHILLIPS

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1 RESERVOIR NAME: PR-86 RESERVOIR

 Dam Height:
 19.00
 13.00
 FEET

 Depth:
 16.00
 19.00
 FEET

 Surface Area:
 7.93
 5.86
 ACRES

 Capacity:
 50.75
 23.44
 ACRE-FEET

40K 73684-00

Volume: 34.43 94.98 AC-FT

*Source Name: INTERIOR DRAINAGE Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 NENWSW 7 37N 32E PHILLIPS

*Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: DAM
*Reservoir: ONSTREAM

Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County
NENWSW 7 37N 32E PHILLIPS

NEINWOW 7 37N 32E I TILELII 3

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1 RESERVOIR NAME: PR-156 RET RES

 Dam Height:
 13.00 FEET

 Depth:
 10.00 FEET

 Surface Area:
 4.70 3.29 ACRES

 Capacity:
 18.80 43.46 ACRE-FEET

- 4. Further, the *Memo* states that if the Verified Motions to Amend are implemented, the issue remarks should be considered resolved and removed from the claims.
- 5. Each claim also received notice-type issue remarks from the DNRC during its reexamination of claims. The remarks state that is no objections are filed, the remarks should be removed. No objections were filed.

PRINCIPLES OF LAW

1. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA; Rule 10, W.R.Adj.R.

- 2. Prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by a preponderance of the evidence. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.
- 3. A preponderance of the evidence is evidence that shows a fact is "more probable than not." *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203, ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.
- 4. If prima facie status is overcome, the burden shifts back to the claimant to demonstrate historical use. *79 Ranch v. Pitsch*, 204 Mont. 426, 432-33, 666 P.2d 215, 218 (1983).
- 5. Section 85-2-248(2), MCA, requires that the Water Court resolve all issue remarks that are not resolved through the objection process. *See also* Rule 7, W.R.Adj.R.
- 6. The Water Court may use information submitted by the DNRC, the Statement of Claim, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate a water right. Sections 85-2-227, -231(2), MCA.
- 7. When resolving issue remarks, the Water Court must weigh the information resulting in the issue remark and the issue remark against the claimed water right. Section 85-2-247(2), MCA. The factual evidence on which an issue remark is based must meet the preponderance of evidence standard before the prima facie status of a claim is overcome. 43Q 200996-00 et al., Order Establishing Volume and Order Closing Case, at 18, June 8, 2015.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The evidence in the record is sufficient to resolve the issue remarks placed on the above-captioned claims.
- 2. The additional information and subsequent recommendations provided in Ms. Weinmeister's *Memo* resolves the issue remarks appearing on the claims. Each claim should be modified as discussed in Finding of Fact No. 3, and the issue remarks should be removed.
- 3. The notice-type issue remarks appearing on each claim served their notice purpose and should be removed from the claims.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, this Master recommends that the Court adopt the changes as outlined above.

Post decree abstracts of the water right claims reflecting the recommended changes are attached to this Report.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service Via Electronic

USA (Dept. of Interior Bureau of Land Mgmt.) 5001 Southgate Dr.
Billings, MT 59101-4669

Mnorris@Blm.gov
MontanaBasins.Enrd@Usdoj.Gov

\JUDGALH2OSRV\Datavol\Share\WC-BASIN FOLDERS\40K PD\40K Cases\40K-R710\40K-0710-R-2022 MR (multiple claims, 248 memo resolves IRs, make changes to res record per memo, remove IRs)vh 12.1.22.docx

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

WHITEWATER CREEK

BASIN 40K

Water Right Number: 40K 73414-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

> Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

> > **Status: ACTIVE**

USA (DEPT OF INTERIOR BUREAU OF LAND MGMT) **Owners:**

> 5001 SOUTHGATE DR BILLINGS, MT 59101 4669

Priority Date: JULY 1, 1942

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (use): **WILDLIFE**

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS

ONSTREAM RESERVOIR.

Volume: 61.38 AC-FT

UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF PEA LAKE **Source Name:**

SURFACE WATER **Source Type:**

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID **Govt Lot** Otr Sec Sec Twp Rge County **SESWNE** 31E **PHILLIPS** 1 6

37N

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: DAM

Reservoir: ONSTREAM Reservoir Name: PR-86 RESERVOIR

> **Govt Lot** Otr Sec Sec **Twp** Rge **County**

> > SESWNE 6 37N 31E **PHILLIPS**

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1

Dam Height: 19.00 FEET Depth: 16.00 FEET **Surface Area: 7.93 ACRES**

50.75 ACRE-FEET Capacity:

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Place of Use:

<u>ID</u> **Govt Lot** Otr Sec <u>Acres</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> Rge **County** 1

SESWNE 6 37N 31E **PHILLIPS**

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

73414-00 73415-00

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

WHITEWATER CREEK

BASIN 40K

Water Right Number: 40K 73684-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

> Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

> > **Status: ACTIVE**

USA (DEPT OF INTERIOR BUREAU OF LAND MGMT) **Owners:**

> 5001 SOUTHGATE DR BILLINGS, MT 59101 4669

Priority Date: MARCH 11, 1937

Type of Historical Right: USE

WILDLIFE Purpose (use):

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED FOR THIS USE FROM THIS

ONSTREAM RESERVOIR.

Volume: 34.43 AC-FT

Source Name: INTERIOR DRAINAGE SURFACE WATER **Source Type:**

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID **Govt Lot** Otr Sec Sec Twp Rge **County NENWSW** 32E 1 7

37N **PHILLIPS**

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: DAM

Reservoir: ONSTREAM Reservoir Name: PR-156 RET RES

> **Govt Lot** Otr Sec Sec Twp Rge **County**

> > **NENWSW** 7 37N 32E **PHILLIPS**

Diversion to Reservoir: DIVERSION # 1

Dam Height: 13.00 FEET Depth: 10.00 FEET **Surface Area: 4.70 ACRES**

18.80 ACRE-FEET Capacity:

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Place of Use:

<u>ID</u> **Govt Lot** <u>Acres</u> Otr Sec <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> Rge **County** 1

N2NWSW 7 37N 32E **PHILLIPS**

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

73684-00 73685-00